

New York City Department of Education
Citywide Council on
English Language Learners (CCELL)
Annual Report
July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2017

Prepared by: Carolyn Prager

Assisted by: Teresa Arboleda, President, CCELL

Nargiza Rafieva, 2nd Vice President, CCELL

Yenny Almonte, Member, CCELL

Mitchel Wu, Member, CCELL

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017
Table of Contents

Sections	Pages
I. Introduction, Mission, and Goals	2-3
• Mission	2
• Goals	3
II. Context: New York City Public School ELL Population and Programs	4-6
• ELL Population	4
• ELL Graduation Rates	5
• ELL State Test Common Core Test Results	5
• New York City Public School Program Categories	6
III. CCELL Creation and Composition	7-10
• State Intervention Into NYC ELL Education	7
• Governance of NYC Educational Programs and Policies	7
• Creation of Citywide Community Councils	7
• Early Membership Challenges	8-9
• Organization and Bylaws	9
• Office Location and Administrative Support	10
IV. CCELL Advocacy	11-12
• CCELL Resolution For State Legislation To Increase Elementary School Foreign Language Instruction	11
• CCELL Support For Universal Free Lunch	11
• CCELL Resolution For Distribution of Information About Students' Educational Rights Under State Law	12
V. Building Connections: Communication and Outreach	13-17
• Translation and Interpretation Services, Strategies, and Implementation	13
• CCELL Digital Outreach—Website and Social Media	14
• CCELL Logo and Other Promotion	14
• Connecting To Others	15
• Fostering Council Relationships With The Community	15
• Fostering Council Relationships To The Council	15-16
• CCELL Meeting Presentations, 2015-2017	16-17
VI. Professional Development: Education and Training	18
• Education Initiatives	18
• Training Initiatives	18
VII. Assessment and Recommendations	19
Attachments	20-51
A: Memorandum of Understanding	20-32
B: CCELL Bylaws	33-43
C: Letter Supporting Expansion of Universal Free Lunch	44
D : CCELL Resolution #20 on Translation and Interpretation_	45
E: CCELL Resolution #21 Vacancy Resolution _	46
F: CCELL Resolution #22 Appoint Hebatalla Ibrahim to CCELL_	47
G : CCELL Resolution #23 Appoint Aisuloo Sartbaeva to CCELL_	48
H: CCELL Resolution #24 Resolution In Support Of Funding For Foreign Language Instruction In Elementary Schools	49-50
I: CCELL Resolution #25 Resolution To Inform NYC Families Re. Students Educational Rights under State Law	51

I. Introduction, Mission, and Goals

This report covers two academic years, 2015-16 and 2016-17. During this period, the New York City Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) fulfilled its important mission to promote English language learning by advocating on behalf of New York City public school students in bilingual, dual language, and English as a new language (ENL) programs. Through its several initiatives, the Council solidified progress made during its formative academic years 2013-2014 and 2014-2015, while responding to changes and challenges impacting the education of English Language Learners (ELLs) from July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2017.

Council service is a voluntary unpaid commitment from individuals with employment, childcare, and/or other demands on their time. The service of each CCELL member requires significant commitment from those who have other demands on their time and energy. By law, CCELL membership includes parents as well as other community representatives, including a student. Their participation enriches the Council's work. It brings their experience and perspectives as parents, students, and community members to bear on New York City public school ELL programs and services.

Implementation of the mission and goals of the NYC Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) continues to evolve within context of the City's response to the needs of its English Language Learner (ELL) population. As an advisory body to the New York City Department of Education (NYCDOE), to the Chancellor, and to the Mayor, the CCELL must balance the demands made on its time. It must balance its time between engagement with the ELL public education community as well as its engagement with elected and appointed officials and bodies influencing educational programs and policies that have direct or indirect bearing on ELL policies, programs and services.

CCELL Mission

The Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) promotes English language learning by advocating on behalf of New York City public school students in Transitional Bilingual, Dual Language, and ENL programs. The Council also encourages parent engagement in their children's language learning by providing information about public school ELL programs and services and by providing a forum for parents and community concerns about these programs and services.

CCELL Goals

The Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) established three broad goals. In its 2013-2015 Strategic Plan. (See the entire Plan at https://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/c70824_2e987200be5a40b28f5954a038322761.pdf in the “About Us” menu on the Council’s website www.ccell.org). The CCELL articulated the three broad goals to guide the development of strategies that would enable the Council to fulfill its mission of service to the ELL school population and their communities through:

1. **Organization and structure**, including reaching and maintaining full Council membership.
2. **Communication and outreach**, through development of its website and other resources for parents and the community.
3. **Professional development** for new and continuing members and staff.

These goals continue to inform the Council’s implementation of its mission. The CCELL has continued to develop strategies and implement activities to fulfill these goals as documented in its 2013-2015 Annual Report and in this one for 2015-2017. (See the full 2013-2015 Report text at: https://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/c70824_652086d039b5454c86d5cda611f0d421.pdf in the About Us menu on the Council’s website at: www.ccell.org)

In the preceding 2013-2015 Annual Report, the CCELL assessed its progress in carrying out the Strategic Plan’s goals. Based on this assessment, it made six recommendations for continued progress. A substantial portion of this current 2015-2017 Report documents the CCELL’s continued progress in implementing the six recommendations:

1. Committee Structure Implementation (see Section III: CCELL Creation and Composition, below).
2. Education and Training of Members and Staff (see Section VI, Professional Development: Education and Training, below).
3. Expansion of ELL Program Range and Reach (see Section IV, CCELL Advocacy, below).
4. Provision of Free English Classes for ELL Parents (see Section VI, Building Connections: Communication and Outreach, below).
5. Provision of Translation Services for ELL Parents at Department of Education Meetings and Events (see Section VI, Building Connections: Communication and Outreach, below).
6. Supporting Adequate State Funding (see Section IV, CCELL Advocacy, below).

II. Context: New York City Public School ELL Population and Programs

New York State law requires that any student who "by reason of foreign birth or ancestry speaks a language other than English, and either understands and speaks little or no English, or who has been identified by any English language assessment instrument approved by the commissioner as a pupil of limited English proficiency, shall receive a program of bilingual education or English as a New Language (ENL) in accordance with standards established by the commissioner." (Source: New York State Education Department, "Key Laws and Regulations: Section 3204," at <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/sss/lawsregs/3204.html>).

ELL Population: At the end of October 2015, New York City Department of Education (NYCDOE) data show that ELLs accounted for 14.3% percent of the overall New York City public school population. However, for academic year 2015-2016, the DOE had classified 150,741 students as ELLs, an increase from the 139,843 reported for 2013-2014. These students came from at least 162 language backgrounds and from at least 187 different parts of the globe. While nearly half were born outside the United States, 50.47% (76,074) or slightly more than half of ELLs were born within the United States.

The following table summarizes the percentage distribution of the 10 largest ELL populations. Compared to the NYCDOE's 2013-2014, the Arabic speaker ELL population increased more than a percentage point to 5.34% from 4.2%, the Chinese decreased from 14.2% to 13.39%, and the Haitian Creole decreased from 2.3% to 1.88%. (Source: New York City Department of Education, Division of English Language Learners and Student Support, *English Language Learner Demographics Report for the 2015-16 School Year*, p. 19, <http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/3A4AEC4C-14BD-49C4-B2E6-8EDF5D873BE4/213766/201516DemographicReportv5FINAL.pdf>)

Top 10 ELL Home Languages Number and Percent of Total ELL Population Citywide New York City Public Schools

Language	Number	Percent
Spanish	92,746	61.53
Chinese (various)	20,191	13.39
Arabic	8,053	5.34
Bengali	6,465	4.29
Russian	3,496	2.32
Urdu	2,983	1.98
Haitian Creole	2,838	1.88
French	1,855	1.23
Uzbek	1,404	.93
Punjabi	990	.66
Other	9,720	6.40
Total	150,741	100.00

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

ELL Graduation Rates: Many former and current ELL learners excel academically. However, in the aggregate, the ELL population overall has a lower graduation rate than the general NYC public school population because of limited English proficiency and exposure to English,. For current and former English language learners combined who entered NYC high schools in 2011, 50.2% graduated by August 2015, compared with 70.5% for all members of that year’s high school graduation cohort. For those ELLs entering in 2012, 50.8% of ELLs graduated in August 2016 compared to 72.6% for the total cohort. (Sources: New York City Department of Education, *New York City Graduation Rates Class of 2017 (2013 Cohort)*, <http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/7A600EF5-571F-4D96-B0DA-35F36416C9F2/0/2017GraduationRatesWebDeck2618.pdf>. See also Excel file with more detailed data breakdown at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/Accountability/data/GraduationDropoutReports/default.htm>.)

The 2015 graduation cohort was defined as those who had started 9th grade in 2011. The 2016 graduation cohort was based on those who had started 9th grade in 2012. The graduation percentages for current and former ELLs combined stayed relatively steady. (Students are considered former ELLs if classified as ELLs in the last two school years.) Understandably, those classified as former ELLs had a significantly higher graduation rate than those classified as current ELLs. In 2016, more students became former ELLs. 84.1% of former ELLs graduated in 2016 compared to 30.8% of current ELLs. **This is one indication of the positive impact of ELL education on their success rate.**

In August 2015 and 2016, graduation figures were somewhat higher than for previous years. In January 2015, the New York State Board of Regents slightly eased the graduation requirements for English language learners for some who had arrived in the United States already as high school students. These students were now eligible to graduate if they had received a score of 55 or higher on the English language arts Regents instead of a previous 62. Such students would also have had to meet other requirements like good attendance and passing three other Regents exams with scores of at least 65.

ELL State Common Core Test Results: NYC student improvement on Statewide tests, especially the ELA, owe something to factors such as changing demographics. (The ELA or English Language Arts test is a NYS exam administered to grades 3-8). However, ELL student improvement on such tests still indicates the positive effects on the quality and quantity of NYC public school ELL programs and services made during this period in response to the State initiated 2014 *Memorandum of Understanding* that required New York City to expand and improve ELL programs and services (see further Section III, below).

Not surprisingly, ELLs are typically more constrained by language on standardized English tests than on math tests. Statewide, 39.8% of all students combined in grades 3-8 scored at levels 3+4 on the State English Language Arts (ELA) Spring 2017 exams but only 4% of current ELLs. Statewide for the ELA, proficiency increased for both “ever” ELLs (students who received ELL services prior to, but not during, the 2016-17 school year) and “current” ELLs (students who received ELL services in the 2016-17 school year). **Significantly, “ever” ELLs outperformed all State grade 3-8 test-takers combined on the ELA. The percentage performing at proficiency level also increased by 5.5 percentage points in 2017 over 2016.**

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

For math, 40.2% of all students statewide scored at proficiency levels 3+4 in 2017. However, 46.8% of NYC “ever” ELLs scored at this level, almost 7% higher than the statewide average. Still, only 13.2% of “current” ELLs scored at this proficiency level. **This suggests that longer exposure to ELL education and English language use has a positive effect on academic achievement, even on such supposedly language neutral subjects as math.**

The following table summarizes New York City ELL student results on New York State proficiency exams given in Spring 2016 and 2017.

% of Students Proficient in Grades 3-8 State Common Core English Language Arts and Math Tests New York City ELLs Scores			
http://www.nysed.gov/news/2017/state-education-department-releases-spring-2017-grades-3-8-ela-and-math-assessment-results			
	2016	2017	Percentage Point Change
Current ELLs/ELA	4.0	5.2	1.2
Ever ELLs/ELA	39.7	45.2	5.5
Never ELLs/ELA	40.8	42.6	1.8
Current ELLs/Math	11.5	13.2	1.7
Ever ELLs/Math	43.6	46.8	3.2
Never ELL/ Math	41.7	42.7	1.0

NYC Public School ELL Program Categories: The NYC Department of Education offers three forms of ELL programs. Parents can choose from transitional bilingual (TBE), dual language (DL), or English as a New Language (ENL) programs. During the 2015-16 school year, 80.95% of NYC ELLs were enrolled in ENL programs, 12.12% in TBE programs, and 4.91% in DL programs. A very small proportion of ELLs (2.02%) were either not served or their program enrollment was not reported.

III. CCELL Creation and Composition

State Intervention into NYC ELL Education: In 2011, NYS found that NYC had failed to adequately meet the needs of English Language Learners (ELLs). In response to a State directive, the City developed a plan to address service shortfalls that enumerated the steps the City would take to improve them. The City agreed to:

- increase enrollment in bilingual programs;
- increase qualified teachers;
- hold principals more accountable for meeting plan goals;
- reduce the number of students needing ELL services for more than six years; and
- require that all students who needed these services be enrolled in them by 2018-2019.

The City signed a *Memorandum of Understanding* to that effect in 2014 (Attachment A; for the text with public comments, see http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/DOE_MOU_FINAL.pdf).

Governance of NYC Education Programs and Policies: As an outgrowth of Mayoral control the Mayor has had direct control of NYC educational policy and programs since 2002. Mayoral control legislation also abolished the former Board of Education and the 32 district Community School Boards. The formerly citywide Board of Education was replaced by the Panel for Educational Policy (PEP) and community district school boards by Community Education Councils (CECs). PEP members are appointed by the mayor and borough presidents. CEC members are elected by parents and appointed by the borough presidents.

Creation of Citywide Community Councils: In 2009, citywide councils were created to provide input into broader areas of educational concern such as English language learner programs. The CCELL was established by New York State Education Law 2590-B, 5. (a) (i) – (iii) to "advise and comment on any educational or instructional policy involving bilingual or English as a second language programs, [and] to issue an annual report on the effectiveness of the city district in providing services to English language learners and making recommendations, as appropriate, on how to improve the efficiency and delivery of such services." The CCELL is to "hold at least one meeting per month open to the public, ... during which the public may discuss issues facing ELLs."

Under NYS State law, the NYC CCELL is composed of 11 voting members and one non-voting member, as follows:

- Nine voting parent members for a two-year term with children in a bilingual or ENL program or in such a program within the past two years.
- Two voting members by the New York City Public Advocate for a two-year term from others with extensive experience and knowledge in the education of English language learners who can make a significant contribution to improving bilingual and ENL programs in the city.
- One non-voting high school senior member for a one-year term who is or has been in a bilingual or ENL program, appointed by the administrator designated by the New York City Department of Education Chancellor to supervise such programs.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

If a parent or student member leaves the Council before his or her term has expired, the law requires that the vacancy be filled, pursuant to a process developed by the Chancellor that shall include consultation with parents of students who receive services for English language learners. When a vacancy occurs in a position appointed by the Public Advocate, the Public Advocate shall appoint a member to serve the remainder of the unexpired term.

Early Membership Challenges: In its original form, the founding legislation hampered CCELL efforts to seat and sustain a full complement of members because it restricted the criteria for those eligible to serve. The first parent members of the CCELL were seated on July 1, 2010. In the following years, the CCELL did not have a full complement of parent members. The Citywide and District Community Education Council elections held in Spring 2011 also resulted in the election of only one parent of an ELL eligible to be seated as a member of the CCELL. The first Public Advocate appointee, Teresa Arboleda, was seated in October 2010. As Council President, she has provided much needed continuity for the CCELL from its inception.

As a result of restrictions on parent eligibility, the CCELL found it challenging to conduct its mandated activities and advocacy in its earlier years because it frequently lacked a quorum. Originally, parents' eligibility to serve required that their children be still enrolled in an ELL public school program. Another hurdle was lack of public familiarity with options open to parent participation, compounded by the limited English proficiency of many from the ELL target community. The problem of ELL parent representation affected other community education advisory boards as well. The 32 District Community Education Councils each also had difficulty seating its one legally required member from the ELL community.

In July 2013, as advocated by the CCELL, State law was amended to expand the pool of eligible parents. Subsequently, parents' participation on the CCELL did not have to end following the termination of their children's ELL designation. Eligibility to serve could continue for those parents of students who had tested out of ELL programs during the past two years. As a result of the expanded pool of potential ELL parent members, the CCELL seated a full Council for the first time in 2015.

In 2015, the Council filled vacancies in accordance with procedures established by State Education Law 2590. Resolution 21 declared a vacancy created by the absence of an appointed member (Attachment E). Resolution 22 appointed Hebatalla Ibrahim to the Council effective December 1, 2015 (Attachment F). Resolution 23 appointed Aisuluu Sartaeva to the Council effective January 5, 2016 (Attachment G). Both new appointments served continuously through June 30, 2017 for the balance of the period covered by this Report.

In the time covered by this Report, 2015-2017, CCELL activity reflects the improved continuity and consistency resulting from fuller parent representation. This, in turn, has enabled the Council to more consistently and creatively carry out the functions and responsibilities intended by law and public policy for New York City's public school ELL population and programs.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

The Council members who served for the period covered by this Annual Report were:

CCELL 2015-2016 School Year					
First Name	Last Name		Title	Start Date	End Date
Yenny	Almonte	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Teresa	Arboleda	Public Advocate	President	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Christina	Assad	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	10/6/2015
Miguelina	Castro	Parent	Treasurer	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Darihana	Gonzalez	Student	Student	8/26/2015	6/30/2016
Bin	Huang	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Awatef	Ibrahim	Parent	VP	7/1/2015	1/5/2016
Hebatalla	Ibrahim	Parent	Member	12/1/2015	6/30/2016
Leonora	Lokaj	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Yohanna	Martinez	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Guillermo	Rodriguez	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	6/30/2016
Aisuloo	Sartbaeva	Parent	Member	1/5/2016	6/30/2016
Sunita	Singh	Parent	Member	7/1/2015	12/1/2015
Mitchel	Wu	Public Advocate	Recording Secretary	7/1/2015	6/30/2016

CCELL 2016-2017 School Year					
First Name	Last Name		Title	Start Date	End Date
Yenny	Almonte	Parent	Member	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Teresa	Arboleda	Public Advocate	President	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Miguelina	Castro	Parent	Member	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Bin	Huang	Parent	Member	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Hebatalla	Ibrahim	Parent	VP	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Leonora	Lokaj	Parent	Member	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Yohanna	Martinez	Parent	Treasurer	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Guillermo	Rodriguez	Parent	Member	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Aisuloo	Sartbaeva	Parent	Member	7/1/2016	6/30/2017
Mitchel	Wu	Public Advocate	Recording Secretary	7/1/2016	6/30/2017

Organization and Bylaws: Since changes to State law in July 2013 enabled the Council to fill all seats for the 2015 reporting period, the Council has increased outreach to the ELL community it serves and to those outside the immediate community impacting the formation and delivery of ELL policies, programs, and services.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

From its inception, Council objectives have included establishing a committee structure to improve Council operations. In Fall 2016, the CCELL created a Bylaws Committee to revise existing bylaws. Its membership included Hebatalla Ibrahim and Mitchel Wu. President Teresa Arboleda assisted with the Committee's work. Their efforts culminated in the new set of bylaws approved on January 15, 2017 (Attachment B, Bylaws)

Office Location and Administrative Support: The CCELL has an office staffed by an administrative assistant at: 45-18 Court Square, room 260, Long Island City, NY 11101. The office is accessible by subway and numerous bus lines. Ms. Viviana Andino has served in that position since 2011. She has not only helped with the day-to-day operations of the Council but has also helped maintain valuable relationships to those inside and outside the immediate community it serves. She was and continues to be available in the office from 9-5 weekdays at 718-752-7394 and by email at ccell@schools.nys.gov.

IV. CCELL Advocacy

In 2015-2017, the CCELL continued to advocate and work towards expanding the range of ELL programs. This included more dual language programs and more neighborhoods with dual language programs. It also worked towards increasing the single pre-K dual language program. In addition, the Council supported changes to State and City programs and services for all NYC students with impact on the well-being of ELL students, families, and other stakeholders. These changes included universal free lunch programs and distribution of information about parent and student educational rights under State law.

In January 2015, NYC announced the expansion of the City's dual language program aimed at students speaking or wishing to learn Mandarin, French, Haitian Creole, Hebrew, Japanese, and Spanish. Dual language programs were to be added to 25 more schools and expanded at 15 schools that already had dual language classes, bringing the number of dual language programs to 177 as of September 2015. Twenty-three new programs were planned for elementary schools, thirteen for middle schools, three for high schools, and one for a K-12 school.

In April, 2016, Schools Chancellor Carmen Fariña announced creation of 38 new bilingual programs across the five boroughs for the 2016-17 school year, reflecting the DOE's commitment to increasing multilingual programs across the City. The expansion included 29 Dual Language and nine Transitional Bilingual Educational programs implemented across 36 schools and serving more than 1,200 students across the

City. (Source:<http://schools.nyc.gov/Offices/mediarelations/NewsandSpeeches/2015-2016/Chancellor+Farina+Announces+38+New+Bilingual+Programs.htm>)

CCELL Resolution For State Legislation To Increase Elementary School Foreign Language

Instruction: In January, 2017, the CCELL passed Resolution 24: *In Support of the New York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign A329/S554 to implement more foreign language instruction in elementary schools* (Attachment H). The Resolution specifically calls for State support of dual language programs. It reads in part:

Whereas, it is also hoped that dual language programs that have long been established, and recently expanded, in New York City will be eligible for additional funding under this resolution to provide needed resources and support for these programs; and

Whereas, students in New York State and especially those in New York City, the nation's most diverse and global city, need to have skills in at least one language other than English in order to successfully confront the challenges of the world of today and tomorrow; now, therefore, be it

Resolved, That the Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) calls upon the New York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign A.329/S.554, to implement more foreign language instruction in elementary schools.

CCELL Support For Universal Free Lunch: On April 4, 2017, the CCELL approved a letter to City Council Speaker Mark-Viverito in support of funding for the expansion of *Universal Free School Lunch* (Attachment C). The letter read in part:

As public school parents and community leaders, we know first-hand that, for many children in our district, school lunch is the only solid meal they can rely on each day. We are so glad that you recognize how transformative universal free school lunch would be for cash-strapped families and so many young people in our district who skip school lunch for fear of being taunted in the lunchroom. Many immigrant families are especially fearful in the current environment and accessing public benefits can feel risky; universal can also help alleviate the stress on these families.

We hope that you will include full expansion of the program in this year's budget so that all 1.1 million public school students and their families can count on universal free school lunch in the 2018 school year.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

CCELL Resolution For Distribution of Information About Students' Educational Rights Under State

Law: In April 2017 the CCELL passed Resolution 25: *Inform New York City Families about Students' Educational Rights under State Law* (Attachment I). The Resolution recommended specific strategies to inform families about students' educational rights such as a publication about these rights to be distributed to all NYC public school families. It reads in part:

WHEREAS, Few New York City families are aware of students' educational rights under state law; and

WHEREAS, Families and other education stakeholders who are informed about students' educational rights play more active and empowered roles in advocating for our city's children; . . . now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Citywide Council on English Language Learners hereby calls upon New York City's and New York State's elected and education officials to

1. Publish thorough, user-friendly information about students' educational rights under state law, using Essential Resources: The Constitutional Requirements for Providing All Students in New York State the Opportunity for a Sound Basic Education (http://bit.ly/Essential_Resources) as a template, and organized based on, but not limited to, the CFE categories; and
2. By September 2017, provide all New York City public school families with a copy of the resulting educational-rights publication.

V. Building Connections: Communication and Outreach

Communication and outreach is one of the CCELLs three major goals. The CCELL concluded its 2013-2015 Annual Report with recommendations of specific strategies to advance this goal. The proposed strategies included activities to:

- Improve communication vehicles for ELL parents and others such as translation and interpretation services and
- Enhance CCELL's online presence through website and social media development.

The Council responded in 2015-2017 in three ways:

- By voicing support for more citywide translation and interpreting services;
- By implementing more digital, social media, and other outreach and promotion activities; and
- By fostering more extensive relationships with and to others in the ELL community and beyond.

Translation and Interpretation Services Strategies and Implementation: In its 2013-2015 Annual Report, the CCELL recommended that meetings, events, and policies of interest to ELL parents be provided in languages spoken by ELL parents.

In September 2015, the CCELL passed Resolution 20 (Attachment D), *The Need for Interpretation/Translation Services for Citywide and District Education Councils*. The Resolution called for interpreting and translations services that would enable Council members to better carry out their duties and responsibilities and to would help Limited English Speaking parents to participate more knowledgeably and more widely in their children's education. The Resolution reads in part:

Whereas, the increase in ELL parents on citywide and district education councils has resulted in the need for additional interpretation/translation services so that council members can adequately perform their duties and responsibilities; and

Whereas, Chancellor's Regulation A-663 establishes the procedures for ensuring that Limited English Speaking parents are provided with a meaningful opportunity to participate in and have access to programs and services critical to their child's education; and therefore be it

Resolved, that the CCELL strongly recommends that the NYCDOE provide additional resources to adequately support interpretation and translation services to citywide and district education council members; and be it further Resolved, that resources include funding for staff to handle the additional interpretation and translation services required by the increase in ELL parents elected to the education councils, which should include interpretation at additional meetings, as well as translation of flyers/notices, agendas, resolutions, minutes and chancellor's regulations; and be it further

Resolved, that interpretation services be expanded to include special meetings and committee meetings, in addition to one calendar and one business meeting a month; and be it further

Resolved, that Council members be allowed to access the T&I telephone services; . . .

The NYC Department of Education **Division of Family and Community Engagement (FACE)** has cooperated with and supported the CCELL in its efforts to reach out to parents. The DOE Translation and Interpretation Unit now provides Spanish translation at every CCELL meeting. It has also translated documents for Arabic, French, and other speakers on the CCELL. The Translation and Interpretation unit offers translation services in Arabic, Bengali, Chinese, French, Haitian Creole, Korean, Russian, Spanish, and Urdu.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

CCELL Digital Outreach—Website and Social Media: The CCELL has maintained a website (www.ccell.org) since early 2012 to make information about its purpose and activities readily available to the public. The site has an FAQ section that explains Council activity and provides updated information about Council members, meetings, events, resolutions, and documents. The Council also maintains a Facebook page (CCELL-Citywide Council on English Language Learners).

In September 2015, the CCELL began updating its website and social media pages. Council members report that the Facebook page has received several “likes” since then. The Council plans to track specific data about Facebook hits in the future.

The following is a partial screenshot of the CCELL website landing page at the beginning of the 2017-2018 academic year with the horizontal menu at the top for: Home, About Us, Minutes, CCELL Resolutions, and CCELL FAQs and the contact menu at the bottom with phone and address.



CCELL Logo and Other Promotion: In 2015-2017, the CCELL worked to promote recognition and identity through print and other distribution materials. In December 2015, it approved a new logo for business cards, letterhead, and other Council communications. In February 2016, it reallocated certain unexpended budget funds to purchase identifying memorabilia such as member polo shirts and pens and flashlights for outreach distribution. The CCELL also had 25 hard copies of the 2013-2015 Annual Report printed professionally and made the Report available electronically on its website.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Connecting to Others: In 2015-2017, the CCELL continued to build connections to those within the ELL community it served as well as to those outside it. In addition to the more immediate community of ELL parents, students, and educators, it sustained necessary and fruitful connections to other official NYC elected and appointed bodies influencing educational programs and policies with direct or indirect bearing on ELL programs and policies. It did so in two ways:

- (1) by Council representation at and participation in their meetings and events and
- (2) by Council invitation for their reciprocal representation and participation at CCELL activities such as its monthly meetings.

Fostering Council Relationships with The Community: CCELL has had to find an appropriate balance between the time it needs to spend within and the time it needs to spend outside its immediate community to advance its mission and goals.

In 2015-2017, it continued to reach beyond the target community to foster relationships with elected and appointed officials and bodies. These included but were not limited to the Public Advocate, the NYC Department of Education Chancellor and staff, and the other official councils such as the Citywide Council on High Schools (CCHS), the Citywide Council on Special Education (CCSE), D75, District Community Education Councils, the Chancellor's Parent Advisory Education Council (CPAC), and the Panel for Educational Policy (PEP) (a replacement for the former Board of Education with the advent of Mayoral control).

In addition, the CCELL President and/or other representatives regularly attended external meetings, such as those of the Educational Council Consortium (an ad hoc group representing all citywide education councils).

Also, as Council minutes record, the President and/or other CCELL representatives regularly attended meetings such as those with the Public Advocate's Office, with Citywide Education Councils, and with the PEP. It maintained relationships with groups sharing common ELL interests. As an example of participation with groups sharing common ELL interests, the CCELL in Fall 2017 held several joint meetings with the Citywide Council of High Schools about ways to improve ELL participation and success in the specialized high school admissions process. Both Councils sought to address the comparatively low percentage of ELLs passing the specialized high school test.

Fostering Additional Relationships of CCELL: During 2015-2017, the CCELL implemented strategies to increase representation at and participation in CCELL meetings from those outside the target community such as from Citywide Councils, from schools, and from the Department of Education on matters concerning the ELL community. The Table of Presentations and CCELL meeting minutes document the diversity of external participation in CCELL meetings.

To maintain a direct connection between the CCELL community and the NYC DOE, the council maintains regular contact with the Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS), which has direct responsibility for English language learner programs and services. DELLSS representatives regularly attend monthly public meetings of the CCELL to provide information and guidance to the members and attendees.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Maintaining a strong working relationship with the DELLSS was and will continue to be vital to the work of the CCELL. At CCELL meetings, the DELLSS provides periodic updates on DOE progress in meeting the goals set by the 2014 *Memorandum of Understanding* with the State Education Department. It offers parent workshops in every borough and provides information on ELL program choices in nine languages. To help in ELL parent recruitment to and engagement with Councils, the DELLSS also organizes an annual conference for ELL parents attended by thousands. In addition, the DELLSS interfaces with the Citywide Council on High Schools and the Citywide Council on Special Education on issues connected to the work of the CCELL.

CCELL Meeting Presentations, 2015-2017: The CCELL structured most monthly meetings to include presentations by representatives from outside the CCELL of interest to families of ELLs, teachers and staff, and members. In the period covered by this report, the CCELL held the following presentations:

Presentations Date, Topic, and Presenter(s)
July 7, 2015 NYCDOE Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) involvement with ELL families, Universal Pre –K, the ELL Borough Parent Conferences, and support for English Language Learners education by Ms. Yalitza Johnson Chief of Staff, Division of English Language Learners.
August 26, 2015 African Women Talk Event presentation by Ms. Constance Asiedu, Member of the CCHS, for September 1, 2015 with request that CCELL help to publicize it
September 17, 2015 Charter Center’s ELL Program presentation by Special Ed Collaboration & ELL Support Team members Melissa Katz and Dixon Deutsch.
October 6, 2015 Commissioner’s Regulation Part 154 presentation by Richard Bellis, Director of Compliance and Policy accompanied by Yalitza Vazquez-Johnson, Chief of Staff, from the DELLSS. Mr. Bellis spoke about the Amendment to Part 154 Commissioner’s Regulation with components such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New ELL identification process and use of qualified personnel • Parent notification, information and meetings • New bilingual and ELL programs requirements and provision of programs • Development of language proficiency team (LPT) • Identification and exit procedures of ELL students with disabilities • Support and Transitional Service • District Planning and Reporting
November 17, 2015 English Classes for Parents presentation by Yvonne Neal, Senior Director of Accountability, Office of Adult and Continuing Education. Ms. Yvonne Neal spoke about the opportunities that parents have with the Office of Adult and Continuing Education including free classes for new American citizens, math and high school completion.
December 1, 2015 Overview of NYCDOE Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) presentation by Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

January 1, 2016
Language Support for Pre-K and Outreach presentation by Natalie Kianoff, Special Advisor, and Brain Fritsch, Director of the Pre-K outreach team, NYC DOE Division of Early Childhood Education.
February 2, 2016
Seal of Biliteracy presentation by Jill Schimmel, Senior Manager of LOTE which the NYC DOE awards to students who meet the criteria upon graduation from high school.
March 1, 2016
Career and Technical Education Program (CTE) High School programs impact on English Language Learners presentation follow-up by Senior Director Kayon Pryce, Office of Post-Secondary Readiness. Manhattan Bridges High Schools student, staff, and Principal, Mirza Sanchez, presented on the CTE program at the Spanish Dual Language school, and its college and real-world preparation.
Budget Allocation. Juan Garcia from the Borough Field Support Center presented on the 2016-2017 School Budget & Fair Student Funding of \$29.2 billion for the DOE. NYS will provide \$2 billion less than its Campaign for Fiscal Equity obligation. Proposed budget weights with student funding formula aligned to the Framework for great schools.
May 3, 2016
Challenges faced by ELL Seniors presentation by Darihana Gonzalez, CCELL Student member and high school senior as tasked by the Council in January to provide a student presentation on ELL college-readiness issues. She enunciated the key support that ELLs need such as afterschool/SAT prep, bridge programs, and performance-based assessments such as portfolio projects.
ELL college readiness presentation by Sugeny Perez-Sadler, Associate Director of the Office of Postsecondary Readiness, with DOE graduation rates. Her statistics showed that college enrollment increasing, particularly in CUNY colleges.
July 12, 2016
'Title III Summer Enrichment for ELLs' programs presentation by Ms. Vazquez-Johnson, Chief of Staff of the DELLSS.
September 15, 2016
Ms. Vasquez-Johnson and Mr. Bellis of the DELLSS presented an update on ELL math and ELA scores.
October 18, 2016
ELL college readiness presentation by Sugeny Pérez-Sadler, Senior Director, College and Career Planning. More students are graduating college ready and college but a gap remains between access and success.
November 1, 2016
Middle and High School application process presentation for ELLs by Mr. Matt Broggini from the Office of Student Enrollment.
December 6, 2016
Free adult English class presentations by Peta-Gayle White, Director of Program Support Office of Adult and Continuing Education (OACE).
February 7, 2017
Seal of Biliteracy presentation by Jill Schimmel, Senior Manager of LOTE, awarded by the NYC DOE to students who meet the requirements upon graduation from high school.
March 7, 2017
ELL-focused Career Technical Education (CTE) High School presentation by John Widlum, Office of Postsecondary Readiness (OPSE), and Shweta Ratra, Principal of Crotona International H.S.
April 4, 2017
Supporting immigrant students and families given current realities presentation by Adriana Lovera from the New York Immigration Coalition.

VI. Professional Development: Education and Training

The CCELL identified member and staff education and training as one of its three major goals of the Strategic Plan. The earlier 2013-2015 Annual Report made strengthening member and staff development one of its six concluding recommendations. In 2015-2017, the CCELL dedicated significant attention to member and staff education and training.

Education Initiatives: Education on topics of interest to the CCELL members and community occurred regularly via monthly meeting presentations made by representatives from the NYC Department of Education such as those documented in the Table of presentations, above. These included but were not limited to presentations from the NYC Department of Education representatives such as NYCDOE Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) and from schools with large ELL populations and programs.

Training Initiatives: The CCELL also encouraged its members to access training, especially that provided by the Department of Education Division of Family and Community Engagement (FACE) for Citywide Council and CEC members and/or staff. FACE training sessions occurred almost every 4th Monday of every month on topics such as Financial Training and Council Budgets (November 2015), Bylaws (September 2016), and Orientation for New 2017-2019 Members (June 2017).

As reflected in CCELL minutes, President Arboleda and/or Administrative Assistant Andino routinely provided information about upcoming training sessions at nearly every Council meeting. Council members were encouraged to attend at least two training sessions an academic year.

VII. Assessment and Recommendations

Based on the results of its activities in 2015-2017, the CCELL anticipates an improved ELL environment based on changes in the State law and City commitment to the expansion of ELL programs and services.

The CCELL also looks forward to sustaining a productive Council membership now that membership stability and continuity has improved in response to changes in the 2013 State law.

Nonetheless, **the major challenge the Council faces will continue to be finding ways to balance competing demands on members' time and energy** to fulfill its mission and carry out its duties and responsibilities by engaging with:

- Those within the immediate community it serves, including parents, teachers, and others; and
- Those outside the Council such as State and City officials, and the Department of Education staff who create the policies and/or implement the programs and services that directly impact ELL students.

Therefore, the CCELL recommends that going forward, the Council continue to:

1. reach out to the ELL community to inform them of their children's right to ELL and other public school education and services;
2. work on a committee structure to improve Council operations, perhaps considering expanding membership to include those outside the Council;
3. maintain a full membership through outreach to those in the community eligible to serve;
4. maintain a membership well informed of their duties and responsibilities through member and staff education and training;
5. work with State and City government, the DOE, and a new Chancellor, if any, to expand ELL programs including dual language in a range of languages and in more neighborhoods across the City; and
6. work with City and State government to provide adequate funding ensuring that ELLs and all public school students receive the services they need to meet State learning standards and be college and career ready.

Attachment A: Memorandum of Understanding



Memorandum of Understanding

between

The New York City Department of Education

and

The New York State Education Department

This Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) sets forth the terms and understanding between the two parties above in order to enhance programs and services for English Language Learners.

Background

DOE is committed to working to improve educational opportunities for all English language learners (ELL), to ensure that students have access to rigorous Common Core-aligned instruction and the full range of educational opportunities within the DOE. The DOE serves approximately 160,000 students identified as ELLs who speak over 160 different languages. ELLs face the challenge of learning a second language while simultaneously acquiring content area skills and concepts. School communities serving ELLs must be supported in strengthening the specialized skill sets necessary to effectively address the academic and linguistic needs of NYC's diverse ELL student population.

Purpose

In New York City, ELL educational services and programs are guided by New York State Education Department Commissioner's Regulations (CR) Part 154, which provides the basic requirements and procedures for ELL education. CR Part 154, as amended by the Aspira Consent Decree, requires schools to form bilingual education programs in grades K-8 when there are 15 or more ELLs of the same language in two contiguous grades, and in grades 9-12 when there are 20 or more ELLs in any single grade. CR Part 154 also determines the number of English as a New Language (ENL, formerly known as ESL) instructional units which ELLs must receive according to their levels of English proficiency. The school system's goal of aligning ELL programs with CR Part 154 ensures that ELLs acquire and develop English language skills while meeting the standards that are expected at their grade and age levels in core subjects.

The DOE is committed to strengthening all ELL programs, including establishing and expanding existing bilingual programs when thresholds are met, as evidenced by the increase in fiscal and personnel resources that will be utilized to support schools.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

The DOE looks forward to the collaborative efforts with NYS Education Department as it accelerates the achievement for all ELLs and sets the bar high for the State and the rest of the nation. Specifically, this MOU demonstrates the ongoing commitment to enhancing and improving the following areas, which are described within this MOU.

- A. Programs and services for all ELLs
- B. Identification processes and placement of ELLs and parent information
- C. Staffing of ELL programs
- D. Accountability procedures and reporting capabilities

Duration

This MOU may be modified by mutual consent of authorized officials from the NYCDOE and the NYSED. This MOU shall become effective upon signature by the authorized officials from the above listed parties and will remain in effect until June 30, 2018. The attached plan with specific, measurable, assignable, results-oriented, and timely goals put forth by NYSED will be implemented by NYCDOE over this period of time, therefore meeting the agreement of the MOU as a testament to our mutual commitment to English Language Learners. Targets and goals have been developed to afford NYCDOE flexibility in implementation.

Contact Information

New York City Department of Education
Carmen Fariña, Chancellor
Department of English Language Learners and Student Support
52 Chambers Street, room 320
New York City, NY 10007

and

New York State Education Department
Dr. John B. King, Jr., Commissioner of Education
89 Washington Avenue
Albany, New York 12234

The two parties below agree to the above Memorandum of Understanding on the 10th day of November in the year 2014.

Signatures:

Carmen Fariña, Chancellor

Dr. John B. King, Jr., Commissioner of Education

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017



THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT / THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK / ALBANY, NY 12234

Office of Bilingual Education and Foreign Language Studies

89 Washington Avenue
Room 528 EB
Albany, NY 12234
Tel. 518-474-8775
Fax 518-474-7948

55 Hanson Place
5th Floor, Room 594
Brooklyn, NY 11217
Tel. 718-722-2445
Fax 718-722-2459

**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
AREAS OF FOCUS FOR ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS**

OVERVIEW OF FOCUS AREAS:

- A. Programs and Services for English Language Learners (ELLs)**
- B. Identification and Placement of ELLs and Parent Information**
- C. Certified Teachers and Staffing**
- D. Accountability**

As of the 2015-2016 school year, the plan should be in alignment with the recently adopted Commissioner's Regulation Part 154.

A. PROGRAMS AND SERVICES FOR ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS

NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:

A.1) High quality Bilingual Education programs (Transitional and Dual Language) geared towards English Language Learners (ELLs) are created in a variety of school models (e.g., themed schools) to meet the needs of all ELL language groups, and expand availability of programs, with priority given to underserved languages and school districts.

- Goal: Increase ELL participation in Bilingual Education programs by 25% each year, such that programs are available for all eligible ELLs by 2018-2019.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.1, Auditor General's Recommendation #8 and #11 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

A.2) Admissions policies for new, small, and specialized schools provide for the full participation of English Language Learners.

- Goal: Demonstrate an overall 5% incremental gain in ELL enrollment each year from 2015-2016 to 2017-2018, in each of the above named types of schools, to ensure ELL representation is comparable to the citywide percentage of ELLs.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.2 and the above mentioned goal.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

A.3) Each high school meets designated ELL enrollment targets, based on a formula which takes into account the number of ELL students in each Community School District or geographic area, such that each school's ELL enrollment is reflective of the number of ELLs in the community school district.

- Goal: Meet the designated enrollment such that 50% of all high schools will meet their designated ELL enrollment targets for the class entering in the 2015-2016 school year. During the 2016-2017 school year, demonstrate that 100% of high schools meet their designated ELL enrollment targets.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.3 and the above mentioned goal.

A.4) CTE, YABC, and D79 programs provide high quality Bilingual and/or ESL instruction to all ELLs.

- Goal: Demonstrate that CTE, YABC, and D79 programs are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) to ensure that 100% of programs provide ESL instruction at a minimum.
- Goal: Demonstrate that CTE, YABC, and D79 programs are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure Bilingual Education programs are provided, such that 25% of programs monitored in 2014-2015 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language, 50% of monitored in 2015-2016 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language, 75% monitored in 2016-2017 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language, and 100% in 2017-2018 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.4 and the above mentioned goal.

A.5) Procedures are in place to improve the continuity of Bilingual Education and ESL programs provided to ELLs across all school districts and grade levels.

- Goal: Reduce by 25% the number of ELLs who did not have access to program continuity in 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018, such that all ELLs will have access to Bilingual Education and ESL program continuity by 2018-2019.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.5 and the above mentioned goal.

A.6) Procedures are in place to improve the quality of Bilingual Education and ESL programs provided to ELLs across all school districts and grade levels in alignment with the Blueprint for ELL Success.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure they meet established criteria for high quality Bilingual Education and ESL programs aligned to the Blueprint for ELL Success, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide high quality programs, and 90%-100% of schools monitored in 2016-2017 provide high quality programs.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.6, Auditor General's Recommendation #11 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

A.7) ELLs with Individualized Education Programs (IEPs) are provided Bilingual Education and/or ESL services that address their linguistic, academic, and social-emotional needs and enable these students to acquire proficiency in English while having meaningful access to grade level curriculum.

- Goal: Increase the availability of Bilingual Education programs and ESL services that meet the needs of ELLs with IEPs by 25%, such that by 2018-2019, all ELLs with IEPs receive Bilingual Education / ESL services that address their linguistic, academic, and social-emotional needs to acquire language and academic proficiency.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.7 and the above mentioned goal.

A.8) Increase the number of ELLs exiting from ELL status within 6 years and ensure that Long Term ELLs (LTEs) receive high quality education in Bilingual Education and/or ESL programs.

- Goal: Increase by 5% in 2015-2016 and each subsequent year through 2018-2019 the number of ELLs exiting from ELL status within 6 years, by focusing on schools that generate consistent numbers of developing ELLs. Also, demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure they meet established criteria for high quality Bilingual Education and/or ESL programs, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide programs, and 90%-100% of schools monitored in 2016-2017 provide programs.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.8 and the above mentioned goal.

A.9) Ensure that Students with Interrupted Formal Education (SIFE) receive high quality education in Bilingual Education and/or ESL programs that target their academic, language and socio-emotional needs.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure they provide appropriate Bilingual Education and /or ESL programs to SIFE, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide programs and instruction, and 90-100% of schools monitored in 2016-2017 provide programs and instruction.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.9 and the above mentioned goal.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

B. IDENTIFICATION / PLACEMENT OF ELLS AND PARENT INFORMATION

NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:

B.1) Centralized locations are established in each borough's Enrollment Office where families of ELL newcomers are provided with accurate, objective, and complete information regarding ELL program options and parental rights in their home languages.

- Goal: Establish a centralized ELL Enrollment Office location in each borough in time for the enrollment process for the 2015-2016 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.1, Auditor General's Recommendation #1 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.2) NYCDOE Department of English Language Learners and Student Support and the Enrollment Office staff collaborate in the provision of comprehensive training about ELL program options, Part 154 regulations, the ELL identification process, and parents' rights, including accessibility to interpretation and translation services. In addition, Enrollment Office staff has access to all current Bilingual Education Program (Transitional and Dual Language) information available in order to timely inform parents.

- Goal: Demonstrate that enrollment center staff is provided with comprehensive Bilingual Education information, program availability, enrollment information, and professional development in the above B.2 topics, such that 50% monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% of monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- Goal: Create and implement a series of ongoing professional development sessions each year for Enrollment Office staff on each of the topics outlined in B.2.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.2 and the above mentioned goals.

B.3) Qualified personnel adhere to the ELL identification and placement process, consistent with the regulatory timeframe that identification be completed at time of enrollment and within ten (10) school days of the student's enrollment - regardless of the time of year. The process includes administration of the Home Language Questionnaire to the parent or person in parental relation, interview of the student and the parent conducted in English and the home language, administration of the NYSITELL to the student to determine English language proficiency, and placement of the student in an appropriate Bilingual Education and/or ESL program in which the student receives the required units of study pursuant to CR Part 154. The ELL identification and placement process includes clear and efficient protocols to address situations where students are not enrolled by the first school to which they are assigned.

- Goal: Create and implement a series of ongoing professional development sessions each year for cluster, network, enrollment, and school staff, in order to reinforce the ELL Identification and Placement process.
- Goal: Train/retrain 50% of aforementioned staff in 2015-2016, and the remaining 50% in 2016-2017, such that all staff is trained/retrained by the end of the 2016-2017 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.3, Auditor General's Recommendation #9 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goals.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

B.4) Parents or other person in parental relation of a student designated as an ELL are provided a high quality orientation session on the state standards, assessments, and school expectations for ELLs, as well as the program goals and requirements for Bilingual Education and English as a Second Language, as prescribed by CR Part 154 and in their home languages.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure high quality orientation sessions are provided, such that 50% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2015-2016 provide high quality orientation sessions, and 90% - 100% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2016-2017 provide high quality orientation sessions.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.4, Auditor General's Recommendations #1, #3 and #5 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.5) Parents of ELLs are given the required opportunity to exercise their right to place their child in Bilingual Education programs in schools where the number of ELL students speaking the same home language in the same grade require such a program. NYCDOE implements a process, with appropriate interventions, to ensure that parental notifications, orientations, and ELL specific bi-annual meetings – all in parents' home languages – are implemented as required by CR Part 154.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that parents of ELLs are provided with the opportunity to place their child in a Bilingual Education program in schools where warranted, such that 50% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.5, Auditor General's Recommendations #2, #3 and #5 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.6) In schools where CR Part 154 does not require the establishment of a Bilingual Education program, ELL parents are given the option of transferring their child to a school within the community school district where an appropriate Bilingual Education program exists, or outside the community school district if a Bilingual Education program does not exist within the district.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that ELL parents are given the option of transferring their child to a school within the community school district where an appropriate Bilingual Education program exists, or outside the community school district if a Bilingual Education program does not exist within the district, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide the transfer option, and 90%-100% of monitored in 2016-2017 provide the transfer option.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.6 and the above mentioned goal.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

B.7) Each school maintains records of signed notices of parents and persons in parental relation that indicate program selection. Each school maintains records of orientation session agendas and sign in sheets for such orientations. Signed notices of parents and persons in parental relation that indicate program selection shall be included in the student's cumulative record. Signed notices of parents and persons in parental relation are in their home languages.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that all necessary documents pertaining to program selection and orientation are maintained in each ELL student's cumulative record, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.7, Auditor General's Recommendations #1, #3 and #7 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.8) Schools and each borough Enrollment Office provide parents of ELLs and other persons in parental relation with information about all Bilingual Education and English as a Second Language programs available in the community school district in the language or mode of communication that parents best understand. Schools also provide information and notices regarding program placement and the rights of such parents or persons in parental relation. Forms of mass communication are used to inform parents about programs and services for ELLs. This information includes communications regarding Bilingual Education program closings and openings, placement, parent orientations, bi-annual meetings with parents, and availability of documents in the home language.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are providing ELL parents with translated Bilingual Education and/or ESL program and placement materials, such that 50% monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% of monitored in 2016-2017 meet goals.
- Goal: Demonstrate that all information contained in B.8 is appropriately and accurately translated at a minimum in the 9 most common languages in NYC. In the event that the 9 most common languages in NYC do not include the 3 most common languages in the borough or community school district of the enrollment center, all information contained in B.8 should also be appropriately and accurately translated into those 3 most common languages of the borough or community school district.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.8, Auditor General's Recommendation #4 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goals.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

B.9) Interpretation to meet the needs of parents and persons in parental relation to ELLs and translation of materials (e.g., enrollment materials, admissions applications, outreach fairs, school meetings and materials, IEP meetings, IEPs, programs available) by qualified translators.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are providing interpretation and translation services to ELL parents, such that 50% monitored in 2015-2016, and 90%-100% of monitored in 2016-2017 meet goals.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.9 and the above mentioned goal.

B.10) Community-based organizations have a meaningful opportunity to participate in the development and creation of effective and sustainable ELL programs and services within the community.

- Goal: Hold quarterly school meetings with community-based organizations during planning time for programs for the 2015-2016 school year. The first meeting should occur in fall 2015. Quarterly meetings continue for the subsequent school years for the duration of this plan.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.10 and the above mentioned goal.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

C. CERTIFIED TEACHERS AND STAFFING

NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:

C.1) Teachers servicing ELLs are appropriately certified pursuant to Part 80 and Part 154 of Commissioner's Regulations.

- Goal: Ensure that the number of teachers providing ESL or Bilingual Education without appropriate certification is reduced by 25% by the end of the 2015-2016 school year, 50% by the end of the 2016-2017 school year, 75% by the end of the 2017-2018 school year and 100% by the end of the 2018-2019 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.1, and the above mentioned goal.

C.2) As prescribed by the IEPs for ELLs, qualified bilingual teachers, speech pathologists, reading specialists, and other support personnel provide high quality Bilingual and Special Education services to students in their home language. In instances when Bilingual Education programs cannot be provided for ELLs with an IEP, a bilingual paraprofessional is provided as a temporary service solution only.

- Goal: Increase the number of ELLs with IEPs being served by qualified bilingual professionals as opposed to bilingual paraprofessionals each year by 25%, such that, by the end of 2018-2019, all ELLs with IEPs are served by qualified bilingual professionals when their IEPs require.
- Goal: Increase the number of ELLs with IEPs being served according to their IEP by 25% each year, such that by the end of 2017-2018 all ELLs with IEPs are served according their IEPs.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.2, and the above mentioned goals.

C.3) Reduces the shortage of Bilingual Education / ESL teachers in specific language groups by developing and implementing a recruitment plan for attracting Bilingual Education, ESL, and Bilingual Special Education teachers. The plan creates incentives and pathways to secure appropriately certified candidates to ELL-specific teaching positions and increase the pool of bilingual psychologists and bilingual speech teachers.

- Goal: Reduce the shortage of Bilingual Education / ESL teachers in specific language groups by 25% each school year, based on the shortages in the 2014-2015 school year and thereafter, such that by the end of the 2018-2019 school year there are no shortages of Bilingual Education / ESL teachers.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.3, and the above mentioned goal.

C.4) Aligns ELL professional development programs with the NYS Common Core Learning Standards (CCLS), New Language Arts Progressions (NLAP), Home Language Arts Progressions (HLAP), and NYSED's Blueprint for ELL Success. Research-based professional development is targeted to Bilingual, ESL, and content area teachers.

- Goal: Provide ELL-specific research-based professional development opportunities aligned to CCLS, NLAP, HLAP and NYSED's Blueprint for ELL Success to satisfy 50% of each Bilingual / ESL teacher's, and 15% of each content area teacher's professional development.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.4 and the above mentioned goal.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

C.5) In schools where ELLs are not served or are partially served, consistent with collective bargaining agreements, Bilingual and ESL teachers in the district are used to provide ELL instruction aligned to NYS Common Core Learning Standards (CCLS), New Language Arts Progressions (NLAP) and NYSED's Blueprint for ELL Success, rather than assigned to non-instructional tasks.

- Goals: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that, in schools where ELLs are underserved based on data from the 2014-2015 school year, Bilingual and ESL teachers spend the majority of their time providing instruction to ELL students' services in lieu of other non-instructional tasks. Ensure that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.5, and the above mentioned goal.

C.6) Staff in schools who are struggling to meet the instructional and programmatic needs of ELLs, based on, but not limited to, inability to meet Annual Measurable Achievement Objective (i.e., below average ELL graduation rates), attend research-based professional development to meet the needs of the ELLs.

- Goal: Provide ongoing ELL-specific research-based professional development opportunities aligned to the specific needs of identified schools, such that 80% of staff receives training annually.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.6, and the above mentioned goal.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

D. ACCOUNTABILITY

NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:

D.1) Ensures that annual Language Allocation Policy (LAP) Reports are submitted every year prior to the end of the school year and in accordance with the NYSED submission schedule.

- Goal: Submit Language Allocation Policy (LAP) Reports for 100% of schools in all NYCDOE districts and schools prior to each school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.1, Auditor General's Recommendation #10 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goals.

D.2) Ensures that a process and reporting structure is in place to prevent schools from declining to admit potential ELLs during general and over the counter/walk-in enrollment.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are strategically monitored by DELLSS to ensure that schools do not decline to admit ELLs during enrollment and over the counter / walk-in potential ELLs, such that 50% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2014-2015, and 90% - 100 % monitored in 2015-2016 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.2, and the above mentioned goal.

D.3) Develops and implements a system, consistent with collective bargaining agreements, to hold teachers, principals, and superintendents accountable for ELL programs and services, including the incorporation of ELL compliance measures in teacher, principal, and superintendent performance reviews.

- Goal: Include ELL-specific criteria in each performance review system to hold principals accountable for ELL programs and services, including the incorporation of ELL compliance measures in teacher, principal, and superintendent performance reviews.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.3, Auditor General's Recommendation #11 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

D.4) Designs and establishes a system to monitor over-referrals of ELLs to the Committee on Special Education (CSE) while ensuring that those referred to CSE for an individual evaluation are provided with evaluations in each student's home language and in English pursuant to section 200.4(b)(6) of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education.

- Goal: Provide annual ongoing professional development to schools identified as having above average referral rates of ELLs to the CSE to ensure that ELLs are appropriately referred.
- Goal: Ensure that 75% of ELLs referred to the CSE for an individual evaluation are provided with evaluations in a timely manner in each student's home language and in English in 2015-2016, and 100% for each subsequent school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.4, and the above mentioned goals.

D.5) Prior year data is used to provide support to schools that have demonstrated difficulty or a pattern of not being able to conduct timely administration of the NYSITELL.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

- Goal: Increase the number of new ELLs who are timely administered the NYSITELL such that 98% are tested by the end of the 2015-2016 school year, and 99%-100% by the 2016-2017 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.5, Auditor General's Recommendation #6 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

D.6) Prior year data is used to provide support to schools that have demonstrated difficulty in administering the NYSESLAT to all ELLs.

- Goal: Increase the number of ELLs who are administered the NYSESLAT such that 97% are tested by the end of the 2015-2016 school year, and 99% by the 2016-2017 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.6, and the above mentioned goal.

D.7) Ensures current and future system-wide and district level structures adequately support the implementation of this plan, and secures additional resources as necessary for full implementation.

- Goal: Include a designated ELL point person in charge of ensuring NYCDOE Areas of Focus for English Language Learners is met in all current and future system-wide structures.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.7, and the above mentioned goal.

D.8) Provides ELL program data that is collected during the enrollment process via the initial enrollment screen, and applied to school and Bilingual Education program placement.

- Goal: Demonstrate use of ELL program information collected via the initial enrollment screen to ensure adequate Bilingual program placement in schools, such that 80% of students are appropriately placed in Bilingual Education programs in 2015-2016, 90% in 2016-2017 and 100% in 2017-2018.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.8, Auditor General's Recommendation #7 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

D.9) Takes conceptual consolidation of funds into account, creates a monitoring system to track program implementation and ELL supports, and ensures that funds from ELL grants are used toward providing programs and instruction to ELLs.

- Goal: Create a system to strategically monitor by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to determine how funding is allocated in schools, and if funds are being appropriately utilized to meet the needs of their ELL students.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.9, and the above mentioned goal.

Attachment B: Council Bylaws

Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)



Bylaws

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

ARTICLE I – NAME & AUTHORITY

Section 1. Name

The name of the Council shall be: The Citywide Council for English Language Learners (CCELL)

Section 2. Authority

The Council shall have the powers and duties set forth in NYS Education Law, Art. 52-A, §2590 and implementing Chancellor's Regulations.

Mission Statement:

The CCELL promotes second English Language Learning (ELL) by advocating on behalf of NYC public school students in bilingual, dual language, and English as a New Language (ENL) programs. The Council also encourages parent engagement in their children's language learning by providing information about public school ELL programs and services and by providing a forum for parent and community concerns about these programs and services.

ARTICLE II – OFFICERS AND ELECTIONS

Section 1. Officers

a. The Officers of the Council shall be:

President
1st Vice President
2nd Vice President
Recording Secretary
Treasurer

b. No member may hold more than one office at a time.

Section 2. Elections

a. Officers shall be elected by roll call vote, by the majority (6) of the total number of members that constitute the Council (11), [at the Annual Meeting, for a period of one year]. All officers shall serve until their successors have been elected.

b. Candidates for office must be present to be elected.

c. At the beginning of any new Education Council term, in the event that no officer is re-elected or re-appointed to the Council, the Administrative Assistant to the Council (or in his/her absence, a Department of Education representative) shall convene the first meeting of the Council by (i) executing the notice of meeting pursuant to Article III, Section 1; (ii) calling the meeting to order; and (iii) conducting an election from among the council members for a chair *pro-tem*, who will then begin the process of electing officers.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Section 3. Duties of Officers

3.1 President

a. The President shall be the Chief Executive Officer of the Council. He/she shall represent the Council in interactions with the NYC Department of Education and at all official functions; execute all documents on behalf of the Council and exercise all other powers and perform all other duties pertaining to the office of President.

b. The President shall call [*and preside*] at all meetings; shall have the right to take part in the debate on any question under consideration and vote upon all questions before the Council.

c. The President shall be an *ex-officio* member of all committees, and shall have the right to nominate and remove committee chairs, subject to Council veto [*agreement of the Council*]

d. The President shall supervise the Administrative Assistant to the Council on its behalf, and approve all member reimbursement requests except his/her own, which shall be approved by the Treasurer.

3.2 1st Vice President

The 1st Vice President shall exercise the powers and perform the duties of the President in his/her absence, and discharge such functions as may be assigned to her/him by the President or by duly adopted Council resolution.

3.3 2nd Vice President

The 2nd Vice President shall exercise the powers and perform the duties of the President and 1st Vice President in their absence, and discharge such functions as may be assigned to her/him by the President or by duly adopted Council resolution.

3.4 Recording Secretary

The Recording Secretary shall, in conjunction with the President, supervise the Administrative Assistant in the taking and keeping of meeting attendance, minutes, and the voting record on all motions and resolutions. He/she shall read each resolution on the agenda of a calendar meeting; sign all approved minutes, and ensure appropriate record-keeping by the Council, including compliance with the Open Meetings Law and Freedom of Information Law. In the absence of the Administrative Assistant, the Recording Secretary shall be responsible for taking minutes. The Recording Secretary shall also discharge such functions as may be assigned to him/her by the President or by duly adopted Council resolution.

3.4 Treasurer

The Treasurer shall be responsible for working with the Administrative Assistant and designated Department of Education (DOE) staff to ensure that business transactions and member-reimbursement requests are properly documented and follow DOE

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Standard Operating Procedures. The Treasurer shall supervise the Administrative Assistant in preparing budgets and regular financial reports, and shall present same to the Council for approval; he/she shall also sign the President's reimbursement requests. The Treasurer shall also discharge such functions as may be assigned to him/her by the President or by duly adopted Council resolution.

Section 4. Resignation of Officers

An officer who wishes to resign from her/his office shall notify the President in writing (or, if the officer resigning is the President, the 1st Vice President and 2nd Vice President), who shall notify the other Council members within 3 calendar days.

Section 5. Removal of Officers

An officer may be removed from her/his position by vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11) for reasons that obstruct or neglect council obligations, (including unexcused absences and excessive lateness) at a regular or special calendar meeting, provided, if possible that the officer has been given the opportunity to address the Council at such meeting prior to any vote being taken. Notice of the vote to remove such officer shall be included in the notice of meeting and agenda.

Section 6. Officer Vacancies

A vacancy in an office shall be filled for the unexpired term by special election at the next regularly scheduled calendar meeting of the Council. Notice of the vacancy and election to be held shall be included in the notice of meeting. If, in the filling of any vacancy, another office is vacated, that office shall be filled immediately, by special election held at the same meeting.

ARTICLE III – MEETINGS

Section 1. Notice & Public Access

All meetings shall be open to the public except where otherwise permitted by law.

Except as provided in Article III, Section 6, public notice shall be given to the community at least 72 hours prior to all meetings, through local news media and conspicuously posted in one or more designated public places, as provided by the Open Meetings Law (NYS Public Officers Law, Art. 7, Sect. 100-111). The Open Meetings Law requires that public business be performed in an open and public manner, and that the community be fully aware of and able to observe the performance of public officials and attend and listen to their deliberations and decisions.

In addition, notice of all meetings shall be given in writing (in English and other languages, as appropriate) in a form suitable for mass reproduction, to the President of

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

every Parent Association/Parent Teacher Association, the Presidents' Council, heads of schools and parent coordinators to post conspicuously in schools, and to other persons and organizations who have expressed a desire to receive meeting notices.

All meetings shall be held in facilities accessible to the disabled.

Section 2. Member Attendance at Meetings

It is the responsibility of each Council member to attend all regularly scheduled calendar and working/business meetings of the Council.

2.1 Notification of Absence

Except in an emergency, members shall notify the President and the Administrative Assistant at least 24 hours, 1 business day prior to the scheduled meeting time of their intent to be absent. However, such notification shall not in and of itself constitute an excused absence; Chancellor's Regulation D-140.IX.A.1 sets forth the only grounds on which an absence may be deemed excused.

2.2 Unexcused Absences

Any Council member who fails to attend six meetings of the Council within his/her term of office without a valid excuse, tendered in writing to the President and the Administrative Assistant, vacates his/her office by refusal to serve (NYS Ed. Law § 2590). Absences shall be noted as "excused" or "unexcused," as the case may be, in the meeting minutes, and any written excuse tendered shall be attached. If Council members missed a meeting, they have up to one week to provide the proper documentation for the absence to be deemed an excused absence.

After the sixth unexcused absence, the President shall, at the next calendar meeting, present a resolution declaring a vacancy to the Chancellor. Such resolution shall be voted upon at the same meeting.

As this Council holds its business and calendar meetings on the same day, a member who is absent for the day will be declared to have missed two meetings.

2.3 Excused Absences

As provided in CR D-140.IX.A.1, the following shall constitute valid excuses for absence:

- Death of a relative or attendance at a relative's funeral
- Serious illness or injury of the member or family member
- Mandatory court attendance including jury duty
- Military duty
- Job-related conflict which makes absence from a Council meeting unavoidable
- And other reasons the Council deems appropriate.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Excuses not explicitly listed in CR D-140.IX.A.1, shall be 1) notified to the Council in writing at least 24 hours before the meeting; and 2) put on the meeting agenda for the Council to take a vote on whether the excuse is deemed appropriate pursuant to CR D-140.IX.A.1.

Section 3. Annual Meeting for the Election of Officers

The Annual Meeting of the Council shall be held on the first Tuesday of September, except when it falls on holidays or school closures.

The only business considered shall be the election of officers.

Section 4. Calendar Meetings

The Council shall hold calendar meetings at least once a month, at which formal decisions and resolutions will be considered and voted upon and where the public will have the opportunity to address the Council.

4.1 Meeting Schedule

Calendar meetings shall be held on the first Tuesday of each month at 6:15 pm. In the event the day falls on a legal or school holiday, the Council shall vote to schedule the meeting on an alternate date, provided it falls within the same calendar month and is notified in compliance with Article III, Section 1.

At the July calendar meeting, the Council shall review the upcoming school year calendar, taking into account religious observances, parent-teacher conferences and school recess periods, and vote upon any modifications to the calendar meeting schedule that may be required to facilitate attendance by parents and the community. The approved schedule shall be forwarded to the Division of Family and Community Engagement for posting on the DOE website.

4.2 Rescheduling Meetings

The Council shall make every effort to adhere to the schedule of meetings set pursuant to §4.1 in order to ensure ample notice and minimize inconvenience to the public.

If it becomes necessary to reschedule a calendar meeting due to inclement weather or other emergency, a new date shall be set by the President, after consultation with the Council, and included in the notice of cancellation of the scheduled meeting. To the extent possible, the new date shall fall within the same calendar month.

If the Council deems advisable to reschedule a calendar meeting for any other reason, it shall do so by vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11) held no later than the prior month's calendar meeting.

Section 5. Business/Working Meetings

A working/business meeting shall be held on the first Tuesday of each month immediately following adjournment of the calendar meeting.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

As the business meeting is held on the same day as the calendar meeting, in the event there is unfinished business, the Council may vote to schedule an additional business/working meeting as needed. The public shall be notified of all business/working meetings as prescribed in Article III, Section 1."

Section 6. Special Meetings

Special meetings, either business/working or calendar, may be held at the call of the President and must be held upon the written request of 3 members of the Council to the President.

Special meetings held at the request of 3 or more Council members must be held no later than 14 calendar days after receipt of the written request by the President.

The President shall ensure that written notice is given to each member of the Council not less than 48 hours in advance, and that public notice is disseminated as provided for in Article III, section 1. The notice shall state the matter(s) to be considered at the meeting; no other matters may be considered except with the consent of all members present.

Section 7. Executive Sessions

Executive Sessions shall be held as needed to discuss matters that by law are permitted to be discussed in a confidential session closed to the public. Decisions shall be made by a vote of the majority (6) of the total number of Council members (11), and shall be ratified at a calendar meeting by duly recorded roll call vote.

Executive Sessions may be called only to deal with matters enumerated in the Open Meetings Law, §105, including but not limited to:

- Matters of individual privacy: medical, financial, credit or employment history of a particular person or corporation, or matters leading to the appointment, employment, promotion, demotion, discipline, suspension, dismissal, or removal of a particular person.
- Information relating to current or future investigation of criminal offenses which will imperil effective law enforcement if disclosed.
- Discussions regarding proposed, pending or current litigation.

Attendance at an executive session shall be permitted to all members of the Council and to any other person(s) authorized by the President or by a vote of the Council.

An Executive Session may be convened only by motion made during a regularly scheduled or special business/working or calendar meeting. Such motion shall identify general areas to be considered during the Executive Session and must pass by a vote of the majority (6) of the total number of Council members (11).

ARTICLE IV – CONDUCT OF BUSINESS AT MEETINGS

Section 1. Agendas

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

1.1 Calendar Meetings

Each notice of a calendar meeting shall state the topic(s) to be considered and be accompanied by the text of any resolutions proposed for adoption by the Council. A detailed agenda shall be available at the meeting.

Agenda topics for each calendar meetings shall be set at a business meeting held at least one month in advance. Council members shall have the opportunity to add items to the agenda by notifying the President in writing no later than 3 calendar days before the meeting, but the President shall make the final decision on agenda topics, subject to the provisions of §1.2 (Resolutions).

1.2 Resolutions

Resolutions may be placed on the agenda by:

- a vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11), taken during a business/working meeting; or
- 3 members of the Council who shall have submitted such item to the President and the Administrative Assistant at least 3 calendar days before the calendar meeting; or
- a member of the Council at any time provided that (i) he/she shall have delivered a copy thereof to the President and the Administrative Assistant before the start of the calendar meeting; (ii) such addition is consented to by a vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11); and (iii) copies thereof are distributed to each council member prior to the call to order.

1.3 Business/Working Meetings

The agenda for each business/working meeting shall be developed by the President. Members of the Council shall have the opportunity to place an item on the agenda by notifying the President in writing no later than 2 calendar days before the meeting, and to raise issues for consideration under New Business. Any last minute requests must be made prior to 4:00pm the day of the meeting. Last minute requests are still subject to the President's approval.

Section 2. Order of Business at Calendar Meetings

The order of business at any calendar meeting shall be as follows:

1. Call to Order and Roll Call
2. Approval of minutes
3. Program Presentation
4. Report of President
5. Report of representative from the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLS)
6. Report of Committee(s)
7. Resolutions
8. Public Speakers Session

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

9. Vote on Resolutions
10. Adjournment

The regular order of business may be changed by the Chair, with the consent of Council members present at the meeting.

The public shall have the opportunity to comment on resolutions on the agenda prior to Council vote by signing the Speakers' List. In addition, the Public Speakers Session shall be conducted without agenda or other formalities, subject to the Council's prerogative to require speakers to have signed the Speakers' List and to manage time.

Speaking time is limited to 3 minutes per person, including questions and answers. The time may be extended at the discretion of the Chair, and may be limited if necessary to allow all persons who have signed the Speakers' List to speak.

Discussion and charges relating to the competence or personal conduct of individuals will be ruled out of order. A speaker who is ruled out of order forfeits the balance of his/her time and will be directed to leave the microphone; the Chair may take appropriate measures to enforce the ruling.

Section 3. Quorum and Majority

Pursuant to the General Construction Law, § 41, the majority of the total number of voting members of the Council must be present to constitute a quorum regardless of the number of vacancies that exist on the Council. The Council has 11 voting members; therefore, no fewer than 6 members must be present to constitute a quorum and no fewer than 6 votes are needed to carry any motion or adopt any resolution.

3.1 Quorum

If there is no quorum at the time set for a meeting, the members present shall wait for 45 minutes for additional members to arrive, after which time a roll call may be held and a vote taken, by simple majority of members present, to continue with the meeting or adjourn it to another date.

In the case of a calendar meeting without quorum, any program presentation, the report of the representative from the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support and the Public Agenda session shall be allowed to go forward before the meeting is adjourned.

Should the Council decide to continue with the meeting, member reports may be given and discussions held on any pending matters, but no votes or other official action may be taken.

Notwithstanding any provisions to the contrary in Roberts Rules of Order Newly Revised, the Administrative Assistant (or, in his/her absence, the Recording Secretary)

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

shall record Council members' attendance and absences as provided for in Art. III, §2, and make a record of the meeting.

Notice of an adjourned meeting shall be given forthwith to all Council members, and to the public as provided for in Article III, Section 1.

3.2 Official Actions

Official actions of the Council by resolution may be taken only at a regular or special calendar meeting and shall be by vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11).

Except as otherwise provided by law, regulation or these bylaws, all other matters may be decided by vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11), upon a motion presented at any calendar or business meeting.

There shall be no proxy or absentee voting, or polling by phone or e-mail.

Section 4. Minutes

In accordance with the Open Meetings Law, §106, minutes shall be taken at all meetings of the Council. Minutes shall include a record or summary of all resolutions and motions presented, and the votes of individual members on each resolution and motion.

Minutes of all meetings shall be created in electronic format, and shall be available to the public in draft form upon request within two weeks following a meeting, and included on the Council's website. Audio recordings of meetings shall not constitute minutes.

The minutes of all meetings shall be a matter of public record. A printed copy shall be available for inspection at the Council's office.

ARTICLE V - COMMITTEES

The Council may create committees and define their membership as it may determine.

Chairs shall be appointed and removed by the President, and shall serve until the appointing President's term expires. The Council may veto the appointment or removal of any Committee Chair by vote of the majority (6) of the total number of members of the Council (11).

At the discretion of the Chair, membership in committees may be open to persons who are not members of the Council, but all Committee Chairs shall be Council members.

It shall be the responsibility of Committee Chairs to schedule meetings, notify committee members and the public of all meetings, maintain accurate records of all activities and report monthly to the Council. Each committee shall operate under the Open Meetings

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

The Council may appoint one of its members to serve as a Parliamentarian, to advise the Council on matters of procedure and matters pertaining to these bylaws.

Section 2. Compliance

These bylaws shall be the governing instrument of the Council, subject only to applicable laws and regulations. In the event any provision of these bylaws conflicts with applicable laws, regulations or NYCDOE policy, the latter shall be deemed controlling. All other provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

Pursuant to NYS Ed. Law § 2590, a copy of these bylaws shall be filed with the Panel for Educational Policy and the Commissioner of Education, and be available for public inspection at the Council office.

ARTICLE X- COUNCIL PROTOCOLS AND MEMBERS' CODE OF CONDUCT

Section 1. Communications Protocol

All official Council communications shall be sent from the Council's official Department of Education email account. As the Chief Executive Officer, the President shall have access to the password for the Council's official email account in addition to the Administrative Assistant.

The President shall ensure that all Council members receive communication details promptly. The Administrative Assistant shall each be responsible for sending email reminders, drafts of minutes and any other reminders as deemed by the President.

Section 2. Code of Conduct

There should be no personal attacks in emails. Matters of personal attacks will be dealt with during a business meeting. All emails from the Council members pertaining to Council business should be directed to Council members and personnel only.

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Attachment C: Letter Supporting Expanding of Universal Free Lunch



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)
Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President

Hebatalla Ibrahim, Vice President

Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary

Yohanna Martinez, Treasurer

Council Members:

Division of English Language Learners & Student Support: Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor

Yenny Almonte, Miguelina Castro, Bin Huang,

Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff

Leonora Lokaj, Guillermo Rodriguez, Aisuluu Sartaeva

April 4, 2017

Honorable Melissa Mark-Viverito,
250 Broadway Suite 1856
New York, NY 10007

Re: Expansion of Universal Free School Lunch

Dear Speaker Mark-Viverito,

The Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) advocates on behalf of all students in bilingual, dual language and English as a new language (ENL) programs. On behalf of The Citywide Council on English Language Learners, we are so appreciative of the Council's leadership in the fight for universal free school lunch for all public school students. We are thrilled that the Council made this a priority and that you included it in your State of the City address. We are counting on you to ensure that full expansion of the program is included in this year's budget.

As public school parents and community leaders, we know first-hand that, for many children in our district, school lunch is the only solid meal they can rely on each day. We are so glad that you recognize how transformative universal free school lunch would be for cash-strapped families and so many young people in our district who skip school lunch for fear of being taunted in the lunchroom. Many immigrant families are especially fearful in the current environment and accessing public benefits can feel risky; universal can also help alleviate the stress on these families.

We hope that you will include full expansion of the program in this year's budget so that all 1.1 million public school students and their families can count on universal free school lunch in the 2018 school year.

Thank you for your tireless advocacy on behalf of our community. Please let us know if there is any way we can be helpful to you.

Sincerely,

The Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)

CC: Sara Trongone, Community Food Advocates
CCELL Members
Yolanda Torres, Executive Superintendent
Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor
NYC Public Advocate

Liz Accles, Community Food Advocates
Citywide and District Educational Councils
Jessie Mojica, Executive Director of Parent Leadership
Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff

Attachment D: Resolution 20 Supporting Translation and Interpretation



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)

Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President

Awatef Ibrahim, 1st V.P.

Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary

Miguelina Martinez, Treasurer

Council Members:

Yenny Almonte, Christina Assad, Bin Huang, Leonora Lokaj,

Yohanna Martinez, Guillermo Rodriguez, Sunita Singh

Student Member: Darihana Gonzalez

Division of English Language Learners: Milady Baez, Executive Director

Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff

CCELL Resolution 20: The Need for Interpretation/Translation Services for Citywide and District Education Councils

Whereas, the CCELL, was established by NYS Education Law 2590-B, . . . with the power to advise and consent on any educational or instructional policy involving bilingual or English as a Second Language Programs, . . . ; and

Whereas, NYS Education Law 2590-C, Composition of community district education councils, states . . . procedures shall ensure that at least one position on the community council is filled by a parent of a student who is an English Language Learner, . . . within the past two years; and

Whereas, according to the NYCDOE, Department of English Language Learners and Student Support School Year 2013-2014 Demographic Report, 43.3% (or 423,189) of all NYCDOE students report speaking a language other than English at home and ELLs account for 14.3% (or 139,843) of the overall NYCDOE student population; and

Whereas, according to information provided by FACE, during the 2013-2015 term there were ELL Parents on only six CECs and the CCELL did not have a full council; and

Whereas, the elections held for the 2015-2017 term resulted in a full CCELL council and ELL parents on 13 CECs, and

Whereas, the increase in ELL parents on citywide and district education councils has resulted in the need for additional interpretation/translation services so that council members can adequately perform their duties and responsibilities; and

Whereas, Chancellor's Regulation A-663 establishes the procedures for ensuring that Limited English Speaking parents are provided with a meaningful opportunity to participate in and have access to programs and services critical to their child's education; and therefore be it

Resolved, that the CCELL strongly recommends that the NYCDOE provide additional resources to adequately support interpretation and translation services to citywide and district education council members; and be it further

Resolved, that resources include funding for staff to handle the additional interpretation and translation services required by the increase in ELL parents elected to the education councils, which should include interpretation at additional meetings, as well as translation of flyers/notices, agendas, resolutions, minutes and chancellor's regulations; and be it further

Resolved, that interpretation services be expanded to include special meetings and committee meetings, in addition to one calendar and one business meeting a month; and be it further

Resolved, that Council members be allowed to access the T&I telephone services; and be it further

Resolved, that Bilingual glossaries of Department of Education terminology and special education terms and definitions be easily available and accessible to all ELL parents, as well as education councils; and be it further

Resolved, that the CCELL will work cooperatively with the NYCDOE regarding updating Chancellor's Regulation A-663 to reflect recommendations contained in this resolution.

Ref: <http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/FC0B4035-00DF-4318-A1F7-6EF23C15B7F6/0/> 2013-2014 Demographic ReportFinalWINTER2015.pdf

Attachment E: Resolution 21 Vacancy



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President

Awatef Ibrahim, 1st V.P.

Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary

Miguelina Martinez, Treasurer

Council Members:

Yenny Almonte, Bin Huang, Leonora Lokaj, Yohanna Martinez,

Guillermo Rodriguez, Sunita Singh

Student Member: Darihana Gonzalez

Division of English Language Learners: Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor

Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff

Citywide Council for English Language Learners (CCELL) Resolution 21

Declaring a Vacancy on the Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)

WHEREAS, Christina Assad was duly elected to serve as a member of the Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL); and

WHEREAS, Christina Assad has been absent, without rendering in writing a good and valid excuse, for the following Annual, Business and Calendar meetings of the CCELL: July 7, 2015, August 26, 2015, and September 17, 2015; and now be it therefore

RESOLVED, that in accordance with New York State Education Law Section 2590-c(6)(a), we hereby declare to the Chancellor that Christina Assad has vacated her position as a member of the CCELL.

Date: October 6, 2015

Attachment F: Resolution 22 Appointment of Hebatalla Ibrahim



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President

Awatef Ibrahim, 1st V.P.

Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary

Miguelina Martinez, Treasurer

Council Members:

Yenny Almonte, Bin Huang, Leonora Lokaj,

Yohanna Martinez, Guillermo Rodriguez, Sunita Singh

Student Member: Darihana Gonzalez

Division of English Language Learners: Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor

Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff

Citywide Council for English Language Learners (CCELL) Resolution #22

Appoint Hebatalla Ibrahim on the Citywide Council on English Language Learners

WHEREAS Hebatalla Ibrahim of the Citywide Council on English Language Learners application have been approved by the Department of Education

THEREFORE, be it known that the Citywide Council on English Language Learners has a vacancy in its membership, and

WHEREAS, Education Law 2590 States that there shall be eleven voting members on each council and

WHEREAS, there is a unanimous vote by at least six members of the Citywide Council for Hebatalla Ibrahim to join the Citywide Council on English Language Learners immediately, and

WHEREAS Hebatalla Ibrahim application has been approved by the Department of Education, now therefore be it

Resolved, that the Citywide Council on English Language Learners hereby appoints Hebatalla Ibrahim as a member of the Citywide Council on English Language Learners Effective as December 1, 2015

Attachment G: Resolution 23 Appointment of Aisuloo Sartbaeva



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President

Awatef Ibrahim, 1st V.P.

Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary

Miguelina Castro, Treasurer

Council Members:

Division of English Language Learners & Student Support:

*Yenny Almonte, Bin Huang, Hebatalla Ibrahim,
Leonora Lokaj, Yohanna Martinez, Guillermo Rodriguez,
Darihana Gonzales (Student)*

*Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor
Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff*

Citywide Council for English Language Learners (CCELL) Resolution #23

Appoint Aisuloo Sartbaeva on the Citywide Council on English Language Learners

WHEREAS Aisuloo Sartbaeva of the Citywide Council on English Language Learners application have been approved by the Department of Education

THEREFORE, be it known that the Citywide Council on English Language Learners has a vacancy in its membership, and

WHEREAS, Education Law 2590 States that there shall be eleven voting members on each council and

WHEREAS, there is a unanimous vote by at least six members of the Citywide Council for Aisuloo Sartbaeva to join the Citywide Council on English Language Learners immediately, and

WHEREAS Aisuloo Sartbaeva application has been approved by the Department of Education, now therefore be it

Resolved, that the Citywide Council on English Language Learners hereby appoints Aisuloo Sartbaeva as a member of the Citywide Council on English Language Learners Effective as January 5, 2016

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017

Attachment H: Resolution 24 Supporting Foreign Language Instruction



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)
Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President Hebatalla Ibrahim, Vice President Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary Yohanna Martinez, Treasurer
Council Members: Division of English Language Learners & Student Support: Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor
Yenny Almonte, Miguelina Castro, Bin Huang, Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff
Leonora Lokaj, Guillermo Rodriguez, Aisuluu Sartaeva

**CCELL Resolution 24: In Support of the New York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign
A329/S554 to implement more foreign language instruction in elementary schools
January 5, 2017**

Whereas, the CCELL, was established by NYS Education Law 2590-B, . . . with the power to advise and consent on any educational or instructional policy involving bilingual or English as a Second Language Programs, . . . ; and

Whereas, the New York City Council Education Committee held a hearing on November 22, 2016 regarding its Resolution No. 890, calling upon the New York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign A.329/S.554, to implement more foreign language instruction in elementary schools; and

Whereas, the ability to communicate in more than one language is critically important in the interconnected world of the 21st century; and

Whereas, furthermore, there is growing awareness in the United States that creating a multilingual society is crucial to our economic success, national security, and international relations; and

Whereas, today's students, who will have to compete in the global economy and work with people of diverse cultures abroad and at home, thus need to learn one or more foreign languages; and

Whereas, studies have found that young children are better able to learn new languages, and that the ability markedly declines after puberty, as the brain is more ready to create new neural circuits before than after puberty; and

Whereas, in addition, the American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages (ACTFL) states that beginning foreign language instruction early sets the stage for students to develop advanced levels of proficiencies in multiple languages, as younger learners still possess the capacity to develop near native-like pronunciation and intonation in a new language; and

Whereas, ACTFL also reports that children who learn a foreign language beginning in early childhood demonstrate certain cognitive advantages over children who do not; and

Whereas, additionally, longitudinal studies by Harvard University confirm that learning additional languages increases critical thinking skills, creativity and flexibility of the mind in young children; and

Whereas, despite such evidence, a national survey from the Center for Applied Linguistics (CAL) shows U.S. elementary schools cut back on foreign language instruction in recent years; and

Whereas, According to the CAL survey, the percentage of public elementary schools offering foreign language instruction decreased significantly, from 24% in 1997 to 15% in 2008, the latest year for which data is available; and

Whereas, as in most other states, foreign language instruction is not currently found in all public elementary schools in New York, but is needed so that all students are able to develop proficiencies in one or more languages other than English (LOTE); and

Whereas, A.329, sponsored by Assembly member Rozic, and its companion bill S.554, sponsored by Senator Parker, would allocate \$2 million to establish an incentive program for school districts wishing to implement programs of foreign language in the elementary schools and establish an incentive program for college students wishing to become foreign language teachers; and

Whereas, more specifically, A.329 and S.554 would establish a pilot program in five high needs districts (\$200,000 each) to expand foreign language education programs at the elementary level; and

Whereas, in addition, A.329 and S.554 would provide for 100 awards of up to \$10,000 each for college students who are working towards certification in foreign languages education, to cover the costs of tuition and materials for their education; and

NYC DOE CCELL
Annual Report, July 2015-June 2017



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)
Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, President Hebatalla Ibrahim, Vice President Mitchel Wu, Rec. Secretary Yohanna Martinez, Treasurer
Council Members: Division of English Language Learners & Student Support: Milady Baez, Deputy Chancellor
Yenny Almonte, Miguelina Castro, Bin Huang, Yalitza Johnson, Chief of Staff
Leonora Lokaj, Guillermo Rodriguez, Aisuluu Sartaeva

Whereas, it is hoped that the success of these Foreign Language in the Elementary School (FLES) programs will not only encourage the districts to find the funds to continue offering the FLES programs once funding from the bill has ended, but also generate interest in the neighboring districts which will inspire them to implement FLES programs, thus creating a grassroots movement in favor of FLES; and

Whereas, further, regarding the goal to provide funding to encourage college students wishing to become LOTE teachers, it is hoped that this will help to address the current severe shortage of LOTE teachers in New York State which can prevent school districts from offering a variety of languages; and

Whereas, it is also hoped that dual language programs that have long been established, and recently expanded, in New York City will be eligible for additional funding under this resolution to provide needed resources and support for these programs; and

Whereas, students in New York State and especially those in New York City, the nation's most diverse and global city, need to have skills in at least one language other than English in order to successfully confront the challenges of the world of today and tomorrow; now, therefore, be it

Resolved, That the Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) calls upon the New York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign A.329/S.554, to implement more foreign language instruction in elementary schools.

Approved: January 5, 2017

Attachment I: Resolution 25 Informing Parent of Students Educational Rights Under State Law



Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL)

Department of Education of the City of New York

Teresa Arboleda, *President* Hebatalla Ibrahim, *Vice President* Mitchel Wu, *Rec. Secretary* Yohana Martinez, *Treasurer*
Council Members: Division of English Language Learners & Student Support: Milady Baez, *Deputy Chancellor*
Yenny Almonte, Miguelina Castro, Bin Huang, Yalitza Johnson, *Chief of Staff*
Leonora Lokaj, Guillermo Rodriguez, Aisuluu Sartava

CCELL Resolution 25: Inform New York City Families about Students' Educational Rights under State Law, Approved: April 4, 2017

WHEREAS, the Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL), was established by NYS Education Law 2590-B, . . . with the power to advise and consent on any educational or instructional policy involving bilingual or English as a Second Language Programs, . . . ; and

WHEREAS, Few New York City families are aware of students' educational rights under state law; and

WHEREAS, Families and other education stakeholders who are informed about students' educational rights play more active and empowered roles in advocating for our city's children; and

WHEREAS, the major categories of educational rights that the courts adopted in the *Campaign for Fiscal Equity (CFE)* case include:

- Sufficient numbers of qualified teachers, principals, and other personnel;
- Suitable and up-to-date curricula, including an expanded platform of programs to help students who are at risk of academic failure;
- Adequate resources for students with disabilities and English-language learners;
- Appropriate class sizes;
- Sufficient and up-to-date books, supplies, libraries, educational technology, and laboratories;
- A safe and orderly environment; and
- Adequate and accessible school buildings; and

WHEREAS, Transparency, government accountability, and informed civic participation by those directly affected by any social issue are hallmarks of a healthy, anti-discriminatory democracy; and

WHEREAS, Eliminating educational inequities and educational-rights violations will give our children and, in turn, our city a better chance for a brighter future, one filled with opportunity; and

WHEREAS, The Know Your Educational Rights Parent Ambassadors, a group of Central Brooklyn parent leaders associated with the Adelaide Sanford Institute and the Campaign for Educational Equity, have set an example by raising awareness about students' educational rights throughout their communities and by calling upon their local elected and education officials to do the same; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Citywide Council on English Language Learners hereby calls upon New York City's and New York State's elected and education officials to

1. Publish thorough, user-friendly information about students' educational rights under state law, using *Essential Resources: The Constitutional Requirements for Providing All Students in New York State the Opportunity for a Sound Basic Education* (http://bit.ly/Essential_Resources) as a template, and organized based on, but not limited to, the *CFE* categories; and
2. By September 2017, provide all New York City public school families with a copy of the resulting educational-rights publication.

